HEXAGON HOUSING ASSOCIATION

**PROPOSED CONTRACTS FOR RESPONSIVE DAY TO DAY AND VOID PROPOERTY WORKS - HEXAGON LOT 1**

**REPORT ON EVALUATION OF TENDERS**

**Rand Associates Consultancy Services Ltd**

**HEXAGON HOUSING ASSOCIATION**

**PROPOSED CONTRACTS FOR RESPONSIVE DAY TO DAY AND VOID PROPOERTY WORKS**

 **HEXAGON LOT 1**

**EVALUATION OF TENDERS**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Procurement Process** | * *OJEU Restricted Procedures;*
* *OJEU Notice 2015/S 150-276614 dated 3rd August 2015; Notice was in respect of 3 Lots, Hexagon Lot 1, Hexagon Lot 2 and Hexagon Lot 3*
* *9 Bidders submitted pre-qualification questionnaires that met Hexagon’s selection and qualification criteria;*
 |
| **Scope of Works** | * *Responsive Maintenance (including Emergency Works ordered during Normal Working Hours);*
* *Call Handling;*
* *Out of Hours Call Handling;*
* *Out of Hours Emergency Works;*
* *Major Works;*
* *Void Property Inspections;*
* *Void Property Works;*
* *Technical Inspections;*

 *In addition the Contract may include for the Service Provider undertaking the following Works:** *Co-ordination of gas and heating works in Voids (Cap Offs, turn on and test, repairs maintenance and landlord’s certification);*
* *Co-ordination with communal mechanical and electrical contractors;*
* *Co-ordination with Asbestos Consultant on Voids;*
* *Co-ordination with Asbestos Licensed Contractor on Voids;*
* *Property Health Checks/MOTs;*
* *Handyman Services; and*
* *Mutual Exchanges Electrical and Gas Tests*
 |
| **Basis of Contracts** | * *Tendered Percentage Adjustment to Schedule of Rates for Responsive Day to Day Maintenance*
* *Tendered Percentage Adjustment to Schedule of Rates for Void Property Works*
* *Tendered Percentage Adjustment to Schedule of Rates for Major Works*
* *Future inflation based on CPI*
 |
| **Form of Contract** | * *NHF Form of Contract 2011*
* *The M3NHF Schedule of Rates for Responsive Maintenance and Void Property Works Version 6.3*
 |
| **Procurement Process** | * *9 Selected for Tender List for Lot 1*
 |
| **Price /Quality Tender Evaluation Criteria** | * *Price:Quality Ratio; 4000:6000*
* *Quality – Method Statement: Evaluated out of 2,200 marks*
* *Quality – Interview: Evaluated out of 1,300 marks*
* *Quality - Site Visit: Evaluated out of 1,500 marks*
* *Quality - IT Assessment: Evaluated out of 1,000 marks*
 |
| **Budget for Lot 1** | * *For evaluation purposes: total budget is £1,000,000 excluding VAT*
 |
| **Properties included in Lot 1** | Lot 1 | Dwellings and Estates, in Post Codes: CR0, CR7, CR8, SE1, SE5, SE11, SE15, SE17, SE19, SE20, SE21, SE22, SE23, SE25, SE26, SM6 and SW2 |
| **Tender Response** | * *All 9 Bidders submitted a tender,*
 |
| **Price Evaluation of Tender (based on the best price received)** | **Bidder** | **Price** | **Marks Scored** |
| **Axis Europe plc** | £978,074.14 | 3,303.81 |
| **Chigwell London Ltd** | £1,005,106.18 | 3,214.96 |
| **KNK Building Services Ltd** | £964,459.85 | 3,350.45 |
| **Laker BMS Ltd** | £1,056,345.14 | 3,059.01 |
| **MD Building Services Ltd** | £978,159.11 | 3,303.53 |
| **Mountjoy Ltd** | £1,216,579.65 | 2,656.11 |
| **P&R Installation Company Limited** | £807,843.33 | 4,000.00 |
| **TCL Group** | £960,285.75 | 3,365.01 |
| **TSG Building Services Plc** | £1,259,551.45 | 2,565.50 |
| **Order of Evaluation** | *Whilst Tenderers are invited to submit tenders for any or all three Contracts that they “expressed an interest when completing the Pre-qualification questionnaire, Hexagon will award three separate Contracts, Hexagon will not award more than one Contract to a Tenderer.**Tenderers were advised that the Contracts will be evaluated in the order of Hexagon Lot 1, then Hexagon Lot 2 and then Hexagon Lot 3 .**The Tenderer submitting the highest scoring price and quality evaluated tender for Hexagon Lot 1, will have any tender for Hexagon Lot 2 and/or Hexagon Lot 3 discarded in the evaluation of those tenders.**The Tenderer submitting the highest scoring price and quality evaluated tender for Hexagon Lot 2, will have any tender for Hexagon Lot 3 discarded in the evaluation of that tender.* |
| **Comments on Prices Received** | *The percentage discounts tendered by a number of the bidders are currently viewed as sustainable*, *other bidders tendered high percentage adjustments which resulted in the low marks they achieved* |
| **Quality Evaluation – Method Statement** | * *Evaluated by officers of Hexagon and by a senior consultant of Rand Associates consultancy Services Ltd ;*
* *9 Method Statements evaluated*
* *Highest Score Achieved: 1,913.00 out of 2,200 possible marks*
* *Lowest Score Achieved: 1,550.00 out of 2,200 possible marks*
 |
| **Allocation of Marks and Criteria – Method Statement** | **Topic** | **Marks available** |
| *Customer care and quality of work* | *800* |
| *Management of the Works* | *800* |
| *IT Systems* | *300* |
| *Collaborative working* | *300* |

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **Marks Scored for Method Statement** | **Bidder** | **Marks Scored** |
| **Axis Europe plc** | *1,913.00* |
| **Chigwell London Ltd** | *1,707.50* |
| **KNK Building Services Ltd** | *1,777.50* |
| **Laker BMS Ltd** | *1,862.00* |
| **MD Building Services Ltd** | *1,789.00* |
| **Mountjoy Ltd** | *1,896.00* |
| **P&R Installation Company Limited** | *1,686.00* |
| **TCL Group** | *1,804.50* |
| **TSG Building Services Plc** | *1,550.00* |
| **Total Marks Scored pre - Interview** | **Bidder** | **Pre-Interview Total Marks Scored** |
| **Axis Europe plc** | *5,216.81* |
| **Chigwell London Ltd** | *4,922.46* |
| **KNK Building Services Ltd** | *5,127.95* |
| **Laker BMS Ltd** | *4,921.01* |
| **MD Building Services Ltd** | *5,092.53* |
| **Mountjoy Ltd** | *4,552.11* |
| **P&R Installation Company Limited** | *5,686.00* |
| **TCL Group** | *5,169.51* |
| **TSG Building Services Plc** | *4,115.50* |
| **Selection for interview** | *All 9 Bidders were selected for Interview, however Mountjoy Ltd withdrew their tender before the Interviews were held* |
| **Quality Evaluation - Interview** | * *Evaluated by Panel of 3 Officers and 3 Tenant Representatives, with a director of Rand Associates Consultancy Services Ltd acting as non-scoring chairman and facilitator;*
* *8 Bidders interviewed*
* *Highest Score Achieved: 876.08 out of 1,300 possible marks*
* *Lowest Score Achieved: 383.92 out of 1,300 possible marks*
 |
| **Allocation of Marks and Criteria – Interview** | **Topic** | **Marks available** |
| *Customer care and quality of work* | *500* |
| *Management of the Works* | *500* |
| *Collaborative working* | *300* |

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **Marks Scored - Interview** | **Bidder** | **Marks Scored** |
| **Axis Europe plc** | *805.58* |
| **Chigwell London Ltd** | *876.08* |
| **KNK Building Services Ltd** | *865.83* |
| **Laker BMS Ltd** | *872.17* |
| **MD Building Services Ltd** | *383.92* |
| **Mountjoy Ltd** |  |
| **P&R Installation Company Limited** | *807.33* |
| **TCL Group** | *824.63* |
| **TSG Building Services Plc** | *708.00* |
| **Total Marks scored pre-Site Visit** | **Bidder** | **Pre- site Visit Total Marks Scored** |
| **Axis Europe plc** | *6,022.39* |
| **Chigwell London Ltd** | *5,798.54* |
| **KNK Building Services Ltd** | *5,993.78* |
| **Laker BMS Ltd** | *5,793.18* |
| **MD Building Services Ltd** | *5,476.44* |
| **Mountjoy Ltd** | *4,552.11* |
| **P&R Installation Company Limited** | *6,493.33* |
| **TCL Group** | *5,994.14* |
| **TSG Building Services Plc** | *4,823.50* |
| **Selection for Site Visit** | *All remaining 8 Bidders were selected for the Site Visit.* |
| **Quality Evaluation – Site Visit** | * *Evaluated by Panel of 3 Officers;*
* *8 Bidders visited and assessed*
* *Highest Score Achieved: 1,241.83 out of 1,500 possible marks*
* *Lowest Score Achieved: 584.67 out of 1,500 possible marks*
 |
| **Allocation of Marks and Criteria – Site Visit** | **Topic** | **Marks available** |
| *Management of Works and office procedures* | *750* |
| *Customer care and quality of work* | *750* |

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **Marks Scored on Site Visit** | **Bidder** | **Marks Scored** |
| **Axis Europe plc** | *675.67* |
| **Chigwell London Ltd** | *679.67* |
| **KNK Building Services Ltd** | *1,130.50* |
| **Laker BMS Ltd** | *1,241.83* |
| **MD Building Services Ltd** | *896.67* |
| **Mountjoy Ltd** |  |
| **P&R Installation Company Limited** | *1,216.67* |
| **TCL Group** | *584.67* |
| **TSG Building Services Plc** | *682.00* |
| **Total Marks Scored pre-IT Assessment** | **Bidder** | **Total Marks Score Pre-IT Assessment** |
| **Axis Europe plc** | *6,698.06* |
| **Chigwell London Ltd** | *6,478.21* |
| **KNK Building Services Ltd** | *7,124.28* |
| **Laker BMS Ltd** | *7,035.02* |
| **MD Building Services Ltd** | *6,373.11* |
| **Mountjoy Ltd** | *4,552.11* |
| **P&R Installation Company Limited** | *7,710.00* |
| **TCL Group** | *6,578.80* |
| **TSG Building Services Plc** | *5,505.50* |
| **Selection for IT Assessment** | *All remaining 8 Bidders were selected for the IT Assessment* |
| **Quality Evaluation – IT Assessment** | * *Evaluated by Panel of 2 Officers;*
* *8 Bidders had their IT Systems assessed*
* *Highest Score Achieved: 840.00 out of 1,000 possible marks*
* *Lowest Score Achieved: 140.00 out of 1,000 possible marks*
 |
| **arks Scored for IT Assessment** | **Bidder** | **Marks Scored** |
| **Axis Europe plc** | *740.00* |
| **Chigwell London Ltd** | *140.00* |
| **KNK Building Services Ltd** | *460.00* |
| **Laker BMS Ltd** | *340.00* |
| **MD Building Services Ltd** | *840.00* |
| **Mountjoy Ltd** |  |
| **P&R Installation Company Limited** | *300.00* |
| **TCL Group** | *600.00* |
| **TSG Building Services Plc** | *440.00* |
| **Total Marks Scored for Price and Quality** | **Bidder** | **Total Marks Scored** |
| **Axis Europe plc** | *7,438.06* |
| **Chigwell London Ltd** | *6,618.21* |
| **KNK Building Services Ltd** | *7,584.28* |
| **Laker BMS Ltd** | *7,375.02* |
| **MD Building Services Ltd** | *7,213.11* |
| **Mountjoy Ltd** | *4,552.11* |
| **P&R Installation Company Limited** | ***8,010.00*** |
| **TCL Group** | *7,178.80* |
| **TSG Building Services Plc** | *5,945.50* |
| **Post – Evaluation Event** | *The evaluation of the Lot 1 tenders indicated that P&R Installation Company Limited had submitted the most economically advantageous tender, they however are the incumbent Contractor for Lot 2 (for which they had also submitted the most economically advantageous tender) and in view of the stated intention of Hexagon that a Contractor would only be awarded one tender, indicated that their preference was to be evaluated for Lot 2 and to withdraw their tender for Lot 1.**This necessitated a reassessment of the price evaluation for Lot 1 as follows and recalculation of the final scores:* |

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Re-assessed Price Evaluation excluding P&R Installation Company Limited and Mountjoy Ltd** | **Bidder** | **Price** | **Marks Scored** |
| **Axis Europe plc** | £978,074.14 | *3,927.25* |
| **Chigwell London Ltd** | £1,005,106.18 | *3,821.63* |
| **KNK Building Services Ltd** | £964,459.85 | *3,982.69* |
| **Laker BMS Ltd** | £1,056,345.14 | *3,636.26* |
| **MD Building Services Ltd** | £978,159.11 | *3,926.91* |
| **TCL Group** | £960,285.75 | *4,000.00* |
| **TSG Building Services Plc** | £1,259,551.45 | *3,049.61* |
| **Revised Price Quality Evaluation excluding P&R Installation Company Limited and Mountjoy Ltd** | **Bidder** | **Price Marks** | **Total Quality Marks** | **Total Marks** |
| **Axis Europe plc** | *3,927.25* | *4,134.25* | *8,061.50* |
| **Chigwell London Ltd** | *3,821.63* | *3,403.25* | *7,224.88* |
| **KNK Building Services Ltd** | *3,982.69* | *4,233.83* | ***8,216.52*** |
| **Laker BMS Ltd** | *3,636.26* | *4,316.00* | *7,952.26* |
| **MD Building Services Ltd** | *3,926.91* | *3,909.58* | *7,836.49* |
| **TCL Group** | *4,000.00* | *3,813.79* | *7,813.79* |
| **TSG Building Services Plc** | *3,049.61* | *3,380.00* | *6,429.61* |
| **Recommendation** | The overall evaluation indicates that the most economically advantageous tender has been submitted by **KNK Building Services Ltd** (who are also the incumbent contractor for Hexagon Lot 1)and I would recommend that subject to any further due diligence that Hexagon may wish to undertake that this bidder be awarded Preferred Bidder status |

David Miller MRICS, FCIOB

Director

Rand Associates Consultancy Services Ltd

12th November 2015