HEXAGON HOUSING ASSOCIATION

**PROPOSED CONTRACTS FOR RESPONSIVE DAY TO DAY AND VOID PROPOERTY WORKS - HEXAGON LOT 3**

**REPORT ON EVALUATION OF TENDERS**

**Rand Associates Consultancy Services Ltd**

**HEXAGON HOUSING ASSOCIATION**

**PROPOSED CONTRACTS FOR RESPONSIVE DAY TO DAY AND VOID PROPOERTY WORKS**

 **HEXAGON LOT 3**

**EVALUATION OF TENDERS**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Procurement Process** | * *OJEU Restricted Procedures;*
* *OJEU Notice 2015/S 150-276614 dated 3rd August 2015; Notice was in respect of 3 Lots, Hexagon Lot 1, Hexagon Lot 2 and Hexagon Lot 3*
* *9 Bidders submitted pre-qualification questionnaires that met Hexagon’s selection and qualification criteria;*
 |
| **Scope of Works** | * *Responsive Maintenance (including Emergency Works ordered during Normal Working Hours);*
* *Call Handling;*
* *Out of Hours Call Handling;*
* *Out of Hours Emergency Works;*
* *Major Works;*
* *Void Property Inspections;*
* *Void Property Works;*
* *Technical Inspections;*

 *In addition the Contract may include for the Service Provider undertaking the following Works:** *Co-ordination of gas and heating works in Voids (Cap Offs, turn on and test, repairs maintenance and landlord’s certification);*
* *Co-ordination with communal mechanical and electrical contractors;*
* *Co-ordination with Asbestos Consultant on Voids;*
* *Co-ordination with Asbestos Licensed Contractor on Voids;*
* *Property Health Checks/MOTs;*
* *Handyman Services; and*
* *Mutual Exchanges Electrical and Gas Tests*
 |
| **Basis of Contracts** | * *Tendered Percentage Adjustment to Schedule of Rates for Responsive Day to Day Maintenance*
* *Tendered Percentage Adjustment to Schedule of Rates for Void Property Works*
* *Tendered Percentage Adjustment to Schedule of Rates for Major Works*
* *Future inflation based on CPI*
 |
| **Form of Contract** | * *NHF Form of Contract 2011*
* *The M3NHF Schedule of Rates for Responsive Maintenance and Void Property Works Version 6.3*
 |
| **Procurement Process** | * *8 Selected for Tender List for Lot 3*
 |
| **Price /Quality Tender Evaluation Criteria** | * *Price:Quality Ratio; 4000:6000*
* *Quality – Method Statement: Evaluated out of 2,200 marks*
* *Quality – Interview: Evaluated out of 1,300 marks*
* *Quality - Site Visit: Evaluated out of 1,500 marks*
* *Quality - IT Assessment: Evaluated out of 1,000 marks*
 |
| **Budget for Lot 3** | * *For evaluation purposes: total budget is £200,000 excluding VAT*
 |
| **Properties included in Lot 3** | *Lot 3* | *Reserve Contractor to cover all Dwellings and Estates* |
| **Tender Response** | * *All 8 Bidders submitted a tender,*
 |
| **Price Evaluation of Tender (based on the best price received)** | **Bidder** | **Price** | **Marks Scored** |
| **Axis Europe plc** | *£211,375.44* | *2,751.10* |
| **Chigwell London Ltd** | *£188,279.18* | *3,088.58* |
| **J H Maunders Ltd** | *£151,078.18* | *3,849.10* |
| **KNK Building Services Ltd** | *£212,057.85* | *2,742.25* |
| **Laker BMS Ltd** | *£199,218.14* | *2,918.99* |
| **MD Building Services Ltd** | *£218,191.11* | *2,665.17* |
| **P&R Installation Company Limited** | *£145,378.83* | *4,000.00* |
| **TCL Group** | *£218,233.75* | *2,664.64* |

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Order of Evaluation** | *Whilst Tenderers are invited to submit tenders for any or all three Contracts that they “expressed an interest when completing the Pre-qualification questionnaire, Hexagon will award three separate Contracts, Hexagon will not award more than one Contract to a Tenderer.**Tenderers were advised that the Contracts will be evaluated in the order of Hexagon Lot 1, then Hexagon Lot 2 and then Hexagon Lot 3.**The Tenderer submitting the highest scoring price and quality evaluated tender for Hexagon Lot 1, will have any tender for Hexagon Lot 2 and/or Hexagon Lot 3 discarded in the evaluation of those tenders.**The Tenderer submitting the highest scoring price and quality evaluated tender for Hexagon Lot 2, will have any tender for Hexagon Lot 3 discarded in the evaluation of that tender.* |
| **Comments on Prices Received** | *The percentage discounts tendered by a number of the bidders are currently viewed as sustainable*, *other bidders tendered high percentage adjustments which resulted in the low marks they achieved* |
| **Quality Evaluation – Method Statement** | * *Evaluated by officers of Hexagon and by a senior consultant of Rand Associates consultancy Services Ltd ;*
* *8 Method Statements evaluated*
* *Highest Score Achieved: 1,913.00 out of 2,200 possible marks*
* *Lowest Score Achieved: 1,550.00 out of 2,200 possible marks*
 |
| **Allocation of Marks and Criteria – Method Statement** | **Topic** | **Marks available** |
| *Customer care and quality of work* | *800* |
| *Management of the Works* | *800* |
| *IT Systems* | *300* |
| *Collaborative working* | *300* |

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **Marks Scored for Method Statement** | **Bidder** | **Marks Scored** |
| **Axis Europe plc** | *1,913.00* |
| **Chigwell London Ltd** | *1,707.50* |
| **J H Maunders Ltd** | *980.00* |
| **KNK Building Services Ltd** | *1,777.50* |
| **Laker BMS Ltd** | *1,862.00* |
| **MD Building Services Ltd** | *1,789.00* |
| **P&R Installation Company Limited** | *1,686.00* |
| **TCL Group** | *1,804.50* |
| **Total Marks Scored pre - Interview** | **Bidder** | **Pre-Interview Total Marks Scored** |
| **Axis Europe plc** | *4,664.10* |
| **Chigwell London Ltd** | *4,796.08* |
| **J H Maunders Ltd** | *4,829.10* |
| **KNK Building Services Ltd** | *4,519.75* |
| **Laker BMS Ltd** | *4,780.99* |
| **MD Building Services Ltd** | *4,454.17* |
| **P&R Installation Company Limited** | *5,686.00* |
| **TCL Group** | *4,469.14* |
| **Selection for interview** | *All 8 Bidders were selected for Interview.* |
| **Quality Evaluation - Interview** | * *Evaluated by Panel of 3 Officers and 3 Tenant Representatives, with a director of Rand Associates Consultancy Services Ltd acting as non-scoring chairman and facilitator;*
* *8 Bidders interviewed*
* *Highest Score Achieved: 876.08 out of 1,300 possible marks*
* *Lowest Score Achieved: 383.92 out of 1,300 possible marks*
 |
| **Allocation of Marks and Criteria – Interview** | **Topic** | **Marks available** |
| *Customer care and quality of work* | *500* |
| *Management of the Works* | *500* |
| *Collaborative working* | *300* |

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **Marks Scored - Interview** | **Bidder** | **Marks Scored** |
| **Axis Europe plc** | *805.58* |
| **Chigwell London Ltd** | *876.08* |
| **J H Maunders Ltd** | *722.92* |
| **KNK Building Services Ltd** | *865.83* |
| **Laker BMS Ltd** | *872.17* |
| **MD Building Services Ltd** | *383.92* |
| **P&R Installation Company Limited** | *807.33* |
| **TCL Group** | *824.63* |
| **Total Marks scored pre-Site Visit** | **Bidder** | **Pre- site Visit Total Marks Scored** |
| **Axis Europe plc** | *5,469.68* |
| **Chigwell London Ltd** | *5,519.00* |
| **J H Maunders Ltd** | *5,694.93* |
| **KNK Building Services Ltd** | *5,385.58* |
| **Laker BMS Ltd** | *5,653.16* |
| **MD Building Services Ltd** | *4,838.08* |
| **P&R Installation Company Limited** | *6,493.33* |
| **TCL Group** | *5,293.77* |
| **Selection for Site Visit** | *All remaining 8 Bidders were selected for the Site Visit.* |
| **Quality Evaluation – Site Visit** | * *Evaluated by Panel of 3 Officers;*
* *8 Bidders visited and assessed*
* *Highest Score Achieved: 1,241.83 out of 1,500 possible marks*
* *Lowest Score Achieved: 584.67 out of 1,500 possible marks*
 |
| **Allocation of Marks and Criteria – Site Visit** | **Topic** | **Marks available** |
| *Management of Works and office procedures* | *750* |
| *Customer care and quality of work* | *750* |

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **Marks Scored on Site Visit** | **Bidder** | **Marks Scored** |
| **Axis Europe plc** | *675.67* |
| **Chigwell London Ltd** | *679.67* |
| **J H Maunders Ltd** | *1,270.00* |
| **KNK Building Services Ltd** | *1,130.50* |
| **Laker BMS Ltd** | *1,241.83* |
| **MD Building Services Ltd** | *896.67* |
| **P&R Installation Company Limited** | *1,216.67* |
| **TCL Group** | *584.67* |
| **Total Marks Scored pre-IT Assessment** | **Bidder** | **Total Marks Score Pre-IT Assessment** |
| **Axis Europe plc** | *6,145.35* |
| **Chigwell London Ltd** | *6,198.67* |
| **J H Maunders Ltd** | *6,964.93* |
| **KNK Building Services Ltd** | *6,516.08* |
| **Laker BMS Ltd** | *6,894.99* |
| **MD Building Services Ltd** | *5,734.75* |
| **P&R Installation Company Limited** | *7,710.00* |
| **TCL Group** | *5,878.44* |
| **Selection for IT Assessment** | *All remaining 8 Bidders were selected for the IT Assessment* |
| **Quality Evaluation – IT Assessment** | * *Evaluated by Panel of 2 Officers;*
* *8 Bidders had their IT Systems assessed*
* *Highest Score Achieved: 840.00 out of 1,000 possible marks*
* *Lowest Score Achieved: 140.00 out of 1,000 possible marks*
 |

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **Marks Scored for IT Assessment** | **Bidder** | **Marks Scored** |
| **Axis Europe plc** | *740.00* |
| **Chigwell London Ltd** | *140.00* |
| **J H Maunders Ltd** | *200.00* |
| **KNK Building Services Ltd** | *460.00* |
| **Laker BMS Ltd** | *340.00* |
| **MD Building Services Ltd** | *840.00* |
| **P&R Installation Company Limited** | *300.00* |
| **TCL Group** | *600.00* |
| **Total Marks Scored for Price and Quality** | **Bidder** | **Total Marks Scored** |
| **Axis Europe plc** | *6,885.35* |
| **Chigwell London Ltd** | *6,338.67* |
| **J H Maunders Ltd** | *7,164.93* |
| **KNK Building Services Ltd** | *6,976.08* |
| **Laker BMS Ltd** | *7,234.99* |
| **MD Building Services Ltd** | *6,574.75* |
| **P&R Installation Company Limited** | *8,010.00* |
| **TCL Group** | *6,478.44* |
| **Post – Evaluation Event** | *The re-evaluation of the Lot 1 tenders indicated that KNK Building Services Ltd and the evaluation of Lot 2 indicated that P&R Installation Company Limited had submitted the most economically advantageous tenders for those Lots, in view of the stated intention of Hexagon that a Contractor would only be awarded one tender, the tenders of these two companies have to be discounted in the evaluation of Lot 3**This did however necessitated a reassessment of the price evaluation for Lot 3 as neither KNK Building Services Ltd nor P&R Installation Company Limited had submitted a price tender for Lot 3 that achieved the maximum score of 4,000 marks* |

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Recommendation** | The overall evaluation indicates that the most economically advantageous tender for Lot 3 (after the discounting of KNK Building Services Ltd and P&R Installation Company Limited) has been submitted by **Laker BMS Ltd** and I would recommend that subject to any further due diligence that Hexagon may wish to undertake that this bidder be awarded Preferred Bidder status |

David Miller MRICS, FCIOB

Director

Rand Associates Consultancy Services Ltd

12th November 2015